Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts Grade 10

In this three week inquiry-based unit, students will explore topics in education. Through various informational sources, students will be exposed to contemporary issues in the field. They will generate and investigate their own research questions on topics of their choice. The unit will culminate with the creation and of a position paper on an issue in education and a group presentation about the topic. This proposal will consist of claims about the issue that are supported by evidence. The focus is on the gathering, evaluation, and synthesis of information, as opposed to specific persuasive strategies. This model uses education as the topic. However, teachers could choose a topic that better suits their students’ interest, school climate, their own knowledge-base, or other circumstance. For this unit, students need to have prior experience with MLA (Modern Language Association) citation, writing arguments or position papers, public speaking/presentations, and knowledge of school’s research tools.

These Model Curriculum Units are designed to exemplify the expectations outlined in the MA Curriculum Frameworks for English Language Arts/Literacy and Mathematics incorporating the Common Core State Standards, as well as all other MA Curriculum Frameworks. These units include lesson plans, Curriculum Embedded Performance Assessments, and resources. In using these units, it is important to consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.
# Table of Contents

Unit Plan .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 3
General Notes and Resources .......................................................................................................................................................................................... 8
Lesson 1 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 10
Lesson 2 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 14
Lesson 3 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 17
Lesson 4 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 20
Lesson 5 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 23
Lesson 6 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 27
Lesson 7 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 30
Lesson 8 ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 33
CEPA Resources ................................................................................................................................................................................................................. 36
Unit Resources ..................................................................................................................................................................................................................... 43
Appendices A-G ................................................................................................................................................................................................................... 46
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage 1 Desired Results</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESTABLISHED GOALS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.2</strong> Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.8</strong> Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.7</strong> Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.8</strong> Gather relevant information from authoritative print and digital sources, using advanced searches effectively; assess the usefulness of each source in answering the research question; integrate information into the text selectively to maintain the flow of ideas,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transfer</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students will be able to independently use their learning to...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Generate open-ended questions and seek answers through critical analysis of text, media, interviews, and/or observations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Communicate ideas effectively in writing to suit a particular audience and purpose.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Communicate ideas effectively in discourse and oral presentations to suit various audiences and purpose.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Meaning</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNDERSTANDINGS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students will understand that...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U1. There are different, ever-changing theories and ideas surrounding education.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U2. Selective readers are always evaluating bias.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U3. Informational texts contain subjectivity. Informed research requires multiple sources.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1. What does it mean to be educated?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2. How do you identify bias in what you read, see and hear?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Acquisition</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students will know...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K1 there can be subjective and objective information within the same text.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K2 how to evaluate authors and sources for potential bias.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K3 a good research topic is support by a range of data and sources.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K4 the components of a good research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students will be skilled at...</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S1. identifying false statements and fallacious reasoning in the text or the author's viewpoint.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S2. interpreting and synthesizing information and data from various sources to form an opinion.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S3. selecting reputable sources for research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>avoiding plagiarism and following a standard format for citation.</td>
<td>question. K5 there can be more than one answer to a research question if there is data or information to support the answer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.9</strong> Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. <strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.1</strong> Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. <strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.3</strong> Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, identifying any fallacious reasoning or exaggerated or distorted evidence. <strong>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.4</strong> Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly, concisely, and logically such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluative Criteria</td>
<td>Assessment Evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Presentation must be well-researched, rich with evidence, clear, logical, and appealing for audiences with a range of backgrounds. Your final product must include writing, visual media, and speaking.</td>
<td>CURRICULUM EMBEDDED PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT (PERFORMANCE TASK) PT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Goal:</strong> The goal is to write a position paper about an issue in education. You will research an issue in education, present a few of the possible positions, take a stance/pick the best position, and support this stance with evidence from your research. You will then work with your group to create a presentation, from your position papers, about this topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Role:</strong> You are part of a group of education experts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• All work must be professional and attractive.</td>
<td><strong>Audience:</strong> Your immediate audience is the politician running for office. By extension, the constituents that she/he would like to represent if elected are also an audience to consider.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Speech must demonstrate an understanding of successful public speaking strategies.</td>
<td><strong>Situation:</strong> The politician has hired you to provide advice about an important topic in education through a position paper.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The selected audience for your presentation matches your selected issue. (Ex. If you are writing to eliminate the MCAS exam, you would <strong>not</strong> choose to be running for office in Idaho or choose to present the proposal to just other students.)</td>
<td><strong>Product Performance and Purpose:</strong> Drawing from your individual position papers, your group will create a presentation that outlines the key elements of your group’s topic, explores the range of positions on the topic, and takes a stance about the best position and provides logical claims with supporting evidence to explain your stance. The presentation must cite credible sources and use statistical if relevant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Final products must meet MLA and English language conventions.</td>
<td><strong>Standards and Criteria for Success:</strong> You will be judged on both your position paper and your role in the group presentation. Both should be well-researched, rich with evidence, clear, logical, and appealing for audiences with a range of backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Written analysis evaluates source, determines its central idea, and assesses its reasoning and reliability</td>
<td><strong>OTHER EVIDENCE:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Active participation</td>
<td>• Written analysis of research source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Valid reasons for claims about another</td>
<td>• Focused class discussion about education issues</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| OE |
Stage 3 – Learning Plan

Summary of Key Learning Events and Instruction

- **Lesson 1: Introduction to the issue ("What is intelligence, anyway?"):** In this introductory lesson, students learn about current topics in education. It begins with a close reading of *What is Intelligence, Anyway?* by Isaac Asimov. Once Asimov's ideas about education are discerned, students will complete an anticipation guide that highlights key issues in education.

- **Lesson 2: Choosing research questions and model brainstorming questions using the “The Psychopathic School”:** Small group reading of *The Psychopathic School.* Students will discuss the article in small groups, with each group responsible for reading one or two sections. Students will use the *Last Word* protocol to determine main ideas of their section(s). Students will share their ideas about their section(s) with the class. The final product from this discussion will be a list of education topics to research for the CEPA.

- **Lesson 3: Carousel of the “bank” of topics/research questions, discuss findings, and choose topic for project.** Potential research topics (issues in education that were determined in Lesson 2) are written on large sheets of paper and posted around the room. Students participate in a brainstorm-carousel or silent chalk talk. In groups, students rotate from topic to topic, writing what they know about each topic in the space provided and responding to questions written by previous groups. After the brainstorm, there is a class discussion to introduce and explain the topics. Students must select a topic before they leave and submit it as an exit ticket as the first step in selecting a topic to research for the CEPA.

- **Lesson 4: Model Topic with “good” and “bad” articles - College Costs.** In this lesson, using the cost of college as a topic, you will model the next steps in the research process: evaluating various informational sources and generating a research question. You will model this process through think-alouds and by creating your own research questions about the cost of college. Students will then be divided into research teams for their selected topics, given teacher-selected articles, start to evaluate the articles and generate their own research questions. Appendix A: Objectivity and Bias can provide additional instruction for students in differentiating between subjective and objective texts.

- **Lesson 5: Gradual Release - Students work in small groups to analyze a pre-selected article about their chosen topic.** You will model a method for assessing a research source (*Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment* chart) using the *Web Evaluation* document. You will lead a guided practice session with students to assess another source (*College Isn’t for Everyone* article). You will provide two articles for the students to analyze the topic that they have chosen in the prior lessons. Students will analyze one of the articles in a small group and one independently.

- **Lesson 6: Review of (or introduction to) synthesis.** Students will analyze research taken from *Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment* and *Why College Isn’t for Everyone* in terms of big ideas. Students will work with their groups to create a
synthesizing statement.

- **Lesson 7: Writing a position paper and working on a group presentation.** Students will work independently to create the first part of the CEPA in which they write a position paper about the education topic they have researched. Then they will work with the other members of their research group to create a group presentation, drawing from their position papers, about the topic.

- **Lesson 8: Presenting the research (CEPA).** Students will give their group presentations. Presentations will be critiqued by classmates using an evaluation protocol. (See CEPA section for details.)

Adapted from Understanding by Design 2.0 © 2011 Grant Wiggins and Jay McTighe Used with Permission July 2012
General Notes and Resources

**Goal:** The goal of this unit is to help students learn to gather, evaluate, and synthesize information, and present the information in a position paper. In the process of conducting these three steps, students will learn how to recognize bias in potential source material. To a degree, the unit presumes that students can recognize the difference between a text that is purely informational and a text that presents an argument. This unit does not teach specific persuasive strategies. While you may choose to add lessons to the model unit to address persuasive strategies (ethos, logos, pathos), this knowledge is not required for students to complete the CEPA successfully.

This unit was also written to provide a model for teachers who are teaching nonfiction and research. This may represent a paradigm shift from traditional literature-based research. This model uses education as the topic; however, teachers should feel free to use a topic that better suits the student interest.

**Timing:** Presuming 45-minute class periods, Lessons 1-6 will require six to nine teaching days. In total, it will probably take three weeks to complete the unit. Students will need one to two weeks to research their topic, write a position paper, and develop their presentation. Alternatively, they can conduct some of the research and evaluation of sources as homework and then work on the group presentation during class time. Be sure to carefully consider your students and the resources that they have access to outside of school to develop a timeline for research that will work for your class. Consider how much school time your students will need with computer lab access and plan your schedule accordingly. To give yourself time to adequately review and comment on each student’s paper, you may want to plan a week or two on a different topic between the students finishing their position papers and starting their group presentations.

**Research:** There are a number of articles provided with this unit. (See Appendix G: Articles on Topics in Education.) They are meant to be used as teaching tools. Substitute or update them as necessary. In addition, students should be conducting their own research for the CEPA. At a minimum, they should find at least one additional source. During the research process, it will be important for you to have a system to check in with student progress. You will want to check that students are choosing and evaluating appropriate sources, working collaboratively, and keeping appropriate pacing to meet a deadline. Depending on the needs of the class, you may want to provide further instruction or workshop time during the creation of the CEPA to help students with the process of both writing their position papers and mapping out the group presentations. (See lessons 7 and 8).

**Presentations:** To manage the presentations, consider scheduling the presentations on non-consecutive days. You could incorporate an additional unit between presentations, or schedule presentations for one day of each week, or some other configuration of time that suits you, the students, and the school.
Rubric: The rubric provided at the end of the unit is intended to be comprehensive, but you may tailor the rubric to meet the needs of your students. Categories can be eliminated or revised as necessary. You may also choose to have your students create a rubric for the project or use a school rubric. Prior to presenting this rubric to the students, you may choose to have the students engage in an activity where they determine the criteria for success. This could result in a modified rubric. If time does not allow for such an activity, you may consider modifying the rubric yourself. For students with language and processing needs, consider breaking the rubric into smaller, more manageable parts in order to judge each portion of the project discretely. For example, the first standard on the rubric has four bullet points. You may want to create a smaller, separate rubric to address this standard. In addition, depending on the skills that you have been focusing on throughout the year, you may choose to include separate, more elaborate rubrics for areas such as public speaking or citation and/or you may need to substitute a specific school wide rubric.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 1

Brief Overview: In this introductory lesson, students learn about current topics in education. It begins with a close reading of *What is Intelligence, Anyway?* by Isaac Asimov. Once Asimov’s ideas about education are discerned, students will complete an anticipation guide that highlights key issues in education. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

Estimated Time: 45 minutes, 1 day

Instructional Model: Inquiry-based unit

Resources for Lesson:
- *What Is Intelligence, Anyway?* by Isaac Asimov
  [http://www.radford.edu/~jmontuor/Asimov%20on%20intelligence.htm](http://www.radford.edu/~jmontuor/Asimov%20on%20intelligence.htm)
- Appendix B: Subjective and Objective Informational Text (handout)
- Appendix C: Issues in Education Anticipation Guide
- Close reading: [http://www.princeton.edu/mcgraw/library/for-students/remember-reading/](http://www.princeton.edu/mcgraw/library/for-students/remember-reading/). This link is presented as a resource. Your school may have a resource or protocol for close reading which you would prefer to use.
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10  
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education  
Lesson 1: What does it mean to be educated?  
Time: 60 minutes

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

- The difference between subjective and objective information and to identify false statements, unsound reasoning, or bias within the text.

Essential Question addressed in this lesson:

Q1. What does it mean to be educated?  
Q2. How do you identify bias in what you read, see, and hear?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson:

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.2. Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.8 Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:

- Since this is an introductory lesson, you do not need many resources. However, you may differentiate activities based on your student population. If you select an issue other than education, a different article should be used. You can then substitute different articles in Appendix A on objectivity and bias.
- Take the time to review the instructions for close reading with the students as the task will be repeated throughout the unit. If students have not had much practice with close reading, model how to mark up text as you read and question the text.
- The article used in this lesson is not intended to encourage a particular stance. It is best not to promote one viewpoint over another.
- The Appendix C: Subjective and Objective Informational Text handout is designed to be a resource for students as they read the Asimov article. You may need to explain the terms subjective, objective, and bias.
- You may also choose to follow this Asimov article with Appendix A to help students differentiate between objective and subjective texts.
- You can vary these activities to meet the needs of your classroom. Additional supports may include guiding questions, graphic organizers, or use of highlighters.
- Give feedback by quietly speaking to the student and/or writing on his/her paper. If close reading is a new skill or new format, you may choose to provide feedback actively and model the technique.
What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson

• Students need to have experience with independent, close reading; they should feel comfortable reading a text and annotating it with notes and symbols or other methods to document how they’ve engaged with the text.

• Students should also have experience with open-ended classroom discussions. You may choose to insert a lesson about close reading and/or open-ended discussions if you feel it is necessary.

Lesson Sequence

Quick-Write (10 minutes)

• Students begin the class by working on a quick-write, responding to the following prompt: What does it mean to be educated?

• After students complete their writing, ask them to “pair, then share” — have students share their responses with a partner then volunteer to share their responses with the whole group.

Discerning the Main Idea (25 minutes)

• Hand out the Isaac Asimov article, What Is Intelligence, Anyway? by Isaac Asimov, and review the instructions for annotating.

• Give students a copy of the Appendix B: Subjective and Objective Informational Text handout to use as a resource when reading the article. (Pre-teach as necessary.)

• Give students a chance to read the article. They can read it in pairs if necessary.

• Have students go back and annotate/comment on the article and then briefly share their thoughts (with a partner, small group, or whole class). If necessary, review the instructions for open-ended classroom discussions.

• Next, ask students to identify the main idea and the evidence Asimov uses to support it. Give students time to reread the article closely for this purpose. (Note: Since the main idea is not directly stated, you may need to prompt or think-aloud to help students infer the main idea.)

• After students have reread the article looking for the main idea, discuss the following questions:
  - What are the details that support the development of the main idea?
  - What is the author’s viewpoint? Do they agree with Isaac Asimov’s viewpoint?
  - Does the author use subjective or objective evidence to support his viewpoint?
  - What would Isaac Asimov say in response to the question: What does it mean to be educated?

Topics in Education (25 minutes)

• Ask students to complete Appendix C: Issues in Education Anticipation Guide by agreeing or disagreeing with ten statements about education and writing a sentence or two about why.

• As a group, go through the Anticipation Guide statement by statement. Based on whether they agree or disagree with the statement, ask students to move to one side of the room or the other. The focus of the activity is on reacting to the statements. You could also discuss the issues at this time.

• Then discuss the CEPA. Give students copies of the CEPA. Read and discuss the CEPA task.

• Be sure students understand that the topics covered in class discussion, such as the discussions of What is Intelligence, Anyway?
and the Issues in Education Anticipation Guide, possible research topics for the CEPA.

**Formative assessment:**
- Observe student participation in the writing and discussion components of the lesson.
- Circulate during close reading to monitor the information that students are annotating.
- Possible homework/extension activities:
  - Students could revisit their quick-write responses on a classroom blog and respond to other students’ opinions. Ensure this is a classroom blog as opposed to a public forum.
  - You may ask students to choose one of the topics in the Issues in Education Anticipation Guide to write a longer response.
  - Preview outcomes for the next lesson: Students will identify the main idea for *The Psychopathic School*, the argument and claims. This will lead to a list of topics for research for the CEPA.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 2

Brief Overview: Small group reading of *The Psychopathic School*, by John Taylor Gatto. Students will discuss the article in small groups, with each group responsible for reading one or two sections. Students will use The Last Word protocol to determine main ideas of their section(s). Students will share their ideas about their section(s) with the class. The final product from this discussion will be a list of education topics to research for the CEPA. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

Estimated Time: 90 minutes, 2 days

Resources for Lesson 2:
- Appendix D: The Last Word Protocol
- Appendix B: Subjective and Objective Informational Text handout
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10  
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education  
Time (minutes): 90 minutes  
Lesson 2: Introduction to Issues in Education

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

• Explain the education issues identified by the author.  
• Explain how he supports those ideas.  
• Discuss the author’s viewpoint or bias.

Essential Questions addressed in this lesson:

Q1. What does it mean to be educated?  
Q2. How do you identify bias in what you read, see, and hear?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.  
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.2. Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.  
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.8 Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning.

Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions:  
Students may assume that Gatto’s lecture is purely factual. It will be important to address the issue of bias during class discussion.

What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson:

• Students need prior experience or instruction in using The Last Word protocol.  
• Students should be familiar with close reading.

Instructional Tips:

• Room should be arranged for small groups.  
• The article is divided into eight sections, so eight groups are needed.  
• If possible, place students in heterogeneous groups.  
• You may need to review specific vocabulary with the students prior to asking them to read the text.  
• The amount of time needed to read the article and do the Last Word Protocol will vary based on the reading levels of the classes and the size of the groups.  
• To facilitate discussion for English Language Learners, supports such as sentence stems or discussion templates should be provided as needed.
Lesson Sequence

• This lesson is an early step and is intended to help the students gain insight into educational issues, to practice evaluating an author’s perspective and determining the main ideas in a subjective, informational text.
• Students should go into their heterogeneous groups.
• Hand out *The Psychopathic School* and assign one or more sections of the text to each group.
• Explain the context of the article that the students are about to read.
  o Speaker: John Taylor Gatto, a former award-winning teacher, journalist and activist for school reform
  o Occasion: 1990 speech given when Gatto accepted the award for NYC teacher of the year
  o Audience: political officials, stakeholders in education
  o Purpose: to initiate drastic school reforms
  o Subject: the current state of the American schools
  o Tone: passionate, hopeful, evaluative.
• Review The Last Word protocol (3-5 minutes)
• Have students read and annotate their article and choose a quote (15-20 minutes). If students are still developing the ability to evaluate an author’s claims, supply another copy of the Subjective and Objective Informational Text handout (Appendix B)
• Alternatively, ask students how the author would respond to the question, “What does it mean to be educated?”
• Ask students to use Appendix D: The Last Word protocol in their small groups to discuss the article (15-20 minutes).
• After the discussion, ask students to determine the most important ideas in their section of the article and record them on an exit ticket. (2-5 minutes)
• Discuss the article as a whole group. Students will use their exit slips to present their section of the article to the class (25 minutes -- 3 minutes per group).
  o Develop a list of the recurring themes/ideas in the article and generate a list of topics for further research. Keep this list for future discussions.
  o The list of topics and main ideas from the article should include: community service, standardized testing, homework, grades, bilingual/ESL, school choice, technology, online learning, learning time, and college costs.
  o Briefly discuss how the author John Taylor Gatto would answer the question, “What does it mean to be educated?”
  o Collect the exit tickets.
• Preview outcomes for the next lesson: The students will explore the topics generated in this lesson in the next lesson.

Formative assessment:
The exit ticket will help you determine if the students understood the main ideas in the informational text.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 3

Brief Overview: Potential research topics (issues in education that were determined in Lesson 2) are written on large sheets of paper and posted around the room. Students participate in a brainstorm-carousel or silent chalk talk. In groups, students rotate from topic to topic, writing what they know about each topic in the space provided and responding to questions written by previous groups. After the brainstorm, there is a class discussion to introduce and explain the topics. Students must select a topic before they leave and submit it as an exit ticket as the first step in selecting a topic to research for the CEPA. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

Estimated Time: 45 minutes, 1 day

Resources for Lesson 3:
- Large sheets of paper (or sufficient board space) and tape
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education
Lesson 3: Carousel Topic Selection
Time (minutes): 45-60 minutes

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

• Interpret and synthesize information and data from various sources to form an opinion.

Essential Questions addressed in this lesson:

Q1. What does it mean to be educated?
Q3: How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson:

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:

• Because this activity follows the reading of The Psychopathic School, some students may feel compelled to use only the information derived from that discussion. During the brainstorming activity, encourage students to include anything they know or think they know about education regardless of the source.

• You can do this activity as carousel brainstorm or as a silent chalk talk:
  o Put the topics on sheets of paper or on the board.
  o Students, in groups or pairs, rotate from topic to topic, in groups, and are encouraged to pose questions and have silent, written conversations with their peers under each topic.
  o The length of time required for each rotation in the brainstorm may be adjusted as the sheets fill with information. For example, when a student is the first one to write, it may take more time for him/her to list ideas whereas the student approaching the final sheets is likely to see his/her ideas written on the sheet already.
  o Observe students’ behavior. If they start wandering around or otherwise seem “done,” call rotation.

• You will also need to monitor the time for the debriefing.
  o If you have more than 12 minutes, you can go into greater discussion about the topics.
  o If a particular topic generates a considerable amount of discussion, and you feel it is warranted, continue the discussion on the following day. Similarly, if there is not time for everyone to write their “exit ticket,” allow students to email their choices to you or bring them in the next day.

• Place ELL students with strong language partners. If you have students with IEPs, 504s, or language needs and require extra assistance to do research and/or give a presentation, you should consider adjusting the groups to include students who have strengths in those areas.
Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions

- Depending on the political conversations in the community/home, students may have significant bias towards one issue or another.

What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson

- Students should know about the issues raised in the previous day’s discussion of The Psychopathic School.

Lesson Sequence

Introduction to the lesson (3 to 5 minutes)

Review the topics identified from the previous lesson. The topics should include:
- Community service
- Standardized testing
- Homework
- Grades
- Bilingual/ESL
- School choice
- Technology
- Online learning
- Learning time
- College costs

- The following topics may need explanation: community service, standardized testing, school choice, online learning, and learning time.
- Explain to the students that they will be in pairs/small groups and will be given 3 to 5 minutes to respond to each topic. Make sure each group has a marker or pen.
- Remind students to use their own ideas as well as information they obtained in previous discussions.

Selecting a Topic (30 minutes)

- As the students proceed from topic to topic, remind them of the task and encourage them to ask relevant questions about and make appropriate comments on the information already written.
- Monitor the time as well as the students’ behavior to keep the pace moving.
- Debrief (approximately 10 minutes): After students have responded to all of the topics, initiate a debrief using cold calling, volunteers, round robin or some other method to elicit responses.
- Review the topics to ensure the students have information about each issue. Start with any sheets that are blank or have little writing on them.
- Discuss the remaining issues and review the information on the sheets. If something is inaccurate, provide the correct information. If something is particularly insightful, interesting, or creative, highlight it for the class.
- Remind students about the CEPA and the need to select a topic:
  - Ask the students to write their top three choices of topics to research on a piece of paper or index card.
  - Collect these cards as an exit ticket. This will allow you to sort teams before the next lesson.
  - If a student is unable to select a topic, review the information with him/her and help with the selection process.
- Preview outcomes for the next lesson: In the next lesson, the students will use the information they have collected thus far to create potential research questions.

Formative assessment

The selection of a topic will serve as the formative assessment.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 4

Brief Overview: In this lesson, using the cost of college as a topic, you will model the next steps in the research process (evaluating various informational sources and generating a research question) through think-alouds and by creating your own research questions. Students will then be divided into research teams for their selected topics, given teacher-selected articles, start to evaluate the articles and generate their own research questions. If students need more practice with analysis sources, there is an additional lesson about objective and subjective sources. (See Appendix A: Objectivity and Bias.) As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

Estimated Time: 45 minutes

Resources for Lesson
- Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment chart: http://www.bls.gov/emp/ep_chart_001.htm/
- Why College Isn’t for Everyone: http://www.businessweek.com/articles/2012-04-09/why-college-isnt-for-everyone
- A projector, interactive white board, overhead projector, or document camera
- The previous day’s topic charts
- Appendix E: Generating a Research Question Handout
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education
Lesson 4: Generating Research Questions
Time: 45 minutes, 1 day

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

- Generate open-ended research questions.

Essential Question addressed in this lesson:

Q2. How do you identify bias in what you read, see, or hear?
Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson:

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.7. Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions

- Students may struggle to determine what a strong question for research looks like. While a question might be interesting, students need to understand that a well-posed research question will be open-ended and allow room for expansive investigation.
- Because generating questions can be challenging, it is important to model effectively through think-alouds. Circulate through the room as students begin to generate their questions, providing formative feedback during the process.
- The Generating a Research Question handout (Appendix E) will assist students to identify research questions. The vocabulary on this handout may need to be modified or pre-taught based on the language needs of your classroom.

What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson:

Students need to be able to work independently and collaboratively, read critically, and have experience with charts/graphs.

Lesson Sequence

Introduction: 5 minutes

- Project the Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment chart on the board and/or hand out copies to students.
- Have students complete a quick-write (2-3 minutes) answering the following questions:
  - What can you learn from reading this chart? (What is your evidence?)
  - Using this chart, how would you answer the question, What does it mean to be educated?
- Ask students to share their answers with a partner or have a few students share with the whole class.

Teacher Think-Aloud/Modeling (20 minutes)

- Hand out Why College Isn’t for Everyone article. If possible, project the article onto a wall for students to see the specific parts of the text that you are referring to in your think-alouds.
• Give students a chance to read the article. Begin the discussion by modeling a few of your own think-alouds, writing notes or asking a text-based question. Examples of text-based questions could include:
  o What is the topic of this article?
  o What does "unequivocally" mean?
  o Why are so many students dropping out of four-year colleges?
  o What is the author’s viewpoint in this article?
  o What does the author use as evidence?
  o Does the author’s viewpoint support or contradict the information from the Earnings and unemployment rates... chart?
• Note: Students should be encouraged to refer to the text as they answer these questions.

Mini-lesson (5 minutes)
• Give a mini-lesson on how to move from selecting a topic to selecting a research question and introduce the qualities of a strong research question.
  o Model a research question or two that you might want to follow up on after reading the article.
  o Compare your research question to the criteria in the Appendix E: Generating a Research Question.
  o Ask students to determine if your research question meets the criteria.
  o Remind students that a strong research question is:
    ▪ Open-ended
    ▪ Interesting

Group Work on Selected Topics (10 minutes)
• Ask students to work with a partner or in small groups to discuss which questions might make the best research questions.
• Give copies of the previous day’s topic charts (from the exit slips and the brainstorm) to each group.
• Ask students to use the information to generate as many research questions as possible on their chosen topic.
• Move around the room to see that students are selecting questions based on the modeling and mini-lesson guidelines.
• Exit ticket: Each student writes down which question he or she thinks is the best from his or her group and why.
• Preview outcomes for the next lesson: In the next lesson, students will look at articles about their topic and learn how to evaluate a source.

Formative assessment:
• Teacher observation during group work
• Exit ticket
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 5

Brief Overview: You will model a method for assessing a research source (Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment chart) using the Appendix F: Web Evaluation document. You will lead a guided practice session with students to assess another source (College Isn’t for Everyone article). You will provide two articles for the students to analyze the topic that they have chosen in the prior lessons. Students will analyze one of the articles in a small group and one independently. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

Estimated Time: 60-90 minutes, 1-2 days

Resources for Lesson 5:
- Copies of Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment
- Copies of the mission statement of the Center for College Affordability and Productivity: http://centerforcollegeaffordability.org/about/mission-statement
- Articles in Appendix G: Topics in Education
- Projector/laptop or interactive white board
- Copies of the Appendix F: Web Evaluation (four for each student)
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education
Time (minutes): 60-90 minutes, 1-2 days
Lesson 5: Evaluating a source

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

- Selecting reputable sources for research.
- Determine if a source is valid and meets their research needs.

Essential Question addressed in this lesson:

Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson:

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.9-10.8 Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning.
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.7 Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions:

- Students may assume that anything that they get from the Internet is valid, or mostly valid.
- Students may assume that if a person is a professional, he/she is qualified to give a reputable opinion.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:

- Instruction is supported through teacher modeling, whole group practice, small group practice and individual assessment of learning.
- Before this lesson, based on the information from the exit slips from the previous class, assign students their research topics.
- The room should be arranged for work in small groups; students should be seated in their research group.
- If necessary, provide instruction on avoiding plagiarism, MLA citation, median and average, and/or the different domains before continuing with this lesson.
- The web evaluation handout can be modified to meet the needs of the classroom.

What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson:

- How to avoid plagiarism
- Have a functional knowledge of MLA citation and/or resources that can help them with MLA citation (e.g., The OWL at Purdue, Citation Monkey).
- Know the difference between median and average.
- Know the meanings of different domains on the web (e.g., .org, .edu, .com).
- Understand the concept of a research source.
Lesson Sequence

Lesson Opening (3-5 minutes)
- Have students brainstorm three things that make a source valid.
- Then students share these responses with a partner.
- Once the partners have come to a consensus, they will put their ideas on chart paper at the front of the room. If someone else has already posted one or more of their ideas, they may check them off to indicate their agreement.

Teacher Model/Think Aloud (15-20 minutes)
- Introduce the Web Evaluation document (Appendix F), pointing out any times the student responses match the elements identified in the document.
- Discuss the elements that the students did not state.
- Evaluate the Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment chart with the students using a think aloud.
  - In this format, model your thinking as you complete the assignment in front of the class.
  - This is a chance to demonstrate and model. Student discussion could take place later in the lesson.
  - This think-aloud should consist of a thorough review of all the elements identified Appendix F: Web Evaluation.
- Highlight or underline relevant information on the Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment document and record answers to the questions on the Web Evaluation document using a document camera or interactive white board so that students can see this process and follow along on their handouts. If these tools are not available, you could write answers on a whiteboard or blackboard and read information aloud while students follow along.

Whole Class Analysis (15-20 minutes)
- Lead a whole class analysis of Why College Isn't for Everyone.
  - Try not to answer the questions -- elicit responses from the class.
  - You may act as scribe for the class, preferably using technology to annotate the article and record student responses.
  - In this particular article, the students will be able to identify that Richard Vedder (author) directs the Center for College Affordability and Productivity.
  - Guide students to research what the Center is and if it adds to his qualifications and/or bias.
  - Model a web search to find and review this information.
  - If technology is not available, provide students with a printed copy of the mission of this organization.

Group Work/Independent Practice (25-30 minutes)
- Have students work in their groups (according to topic selection) to review one of the two suggested articles on their topic (see Appendix G: Articles on Topics in Education). Circulate and monitor their progress.
- As each group finishes, review responses with the group, specifically addressing misconceptions and areas that need further probing.
- Once you have reviewed the work with the group, and given the necessary feedback, have students take the second article on their topic and repeat the review process independently.
- Preview outcomes for the next lesson: Students will apply this skill as they find and evaluate additional sources for their topic through independent research. Students will learn to synthesize their research in the next lesson.
Formative assessment:
Assess students’ participation in the group analysis of *Why College Isn’t for Everyone*, the small group analysis of a source, and any individual evaluation of a source.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 6

**Brief Overview:** Students will analyze research taken from *Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment* and *Why College Isn't for Everyone* in terms of big ideas. Students will work in their groups to create a synthesizing statement. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

**Estimated Time:** 45 minutes, 1 day

**Resources for Lesson**
- Chart paper (or on chalk/white board)
- The teacher should create his/her own notes from *Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment* and *Why College Isn't for Everyone* for the mini-lesson. Place this information on sticky notes or index cards. You will need 6-8 notes, half from the article and half from the chart.
**Content Area/Course:** ELA Grade 10  
**Unit:** Exploring Topics in Education  
**Lesson 6:** Synthesizing Research  
**Time:** 45 minutes, 1 day

**By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:**

- Synthesize and information acquired from sources.
- Consider all aspects of the sources in order to take an informed stance on a position.

**Essential Question addressed in this lesson:**

Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

**Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson**

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.7 Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.

**Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:**

- Instruction is supported at the beginning with teacher modeling, whole group practice, small group practice and assessment.
- For the teacher modeling, hand out the notes you prepared to 6-8 students.

**Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions:**

- Students may believe that synthesis means they have to use everything equally.
- Students may mistake a review/summary of literature for synthesis.

**What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson**

- Students will need some prior experience with sorting information into categories.

**Lesson Sequence:**

**Lesson Opening (10 minutes)**

- Have students respond to this question, “How do people synthesize multiple sources to develop an informed opinion?”
- From this prompt, create a working definition of synthesis.

**Synthesizing Information (30-40 minutes)**

- Start with a mini-lesson. Display a poster divided into four areas, with “big ideas” about whether or not one should go to college.
- Select four big ideas, such as cost, job availability, income level, and career interest.
- Ask two students place one or two of your previously researched notes (on index cards or sticky notes) in one of the corresponding big ideas areas. As a group, discuss placement of these notes. Have the next 3-4 students plan one of your previously researched notes on the big ideas chart and discuss as a group.
- Model how you would use notes to make an original statement combining the information. (This could be more than one sentence and even a paragraph.)
• Ask each group to take one of the big ideas and create a synthesizing statement based on the notes.
• Give the groups a chance to develop statements.
• Then as a whole class review each statement by placing each along a continuum of strong to weak statements.

**Lesson Closing**

• In the next lesson, students will begin conducting their own research and analysis the sources provided in Appendix G.

**Formative assessment**
The placement of sticky notes on the chart and the statements created by the groups can serve as formative assessments.
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 7

**Brief Overview:** Writing a position paper and working on a group presentation. Students will work independently to create the first part of the CEPA in which they write a position paper about the education topic they are researching. Then they will work with the other members of their research group to create a group presentation, drawing from their position papers, about the topic. Students will use two articles provided in Appendix G: Articles on Topics in Education, and will find one additional source. Other class members will be conducting research on the same topic. The overall number of sources required can also be differentiated to best meet the needs of your students. As you plan, consider the variability of learners in your class and make adaptations as necessary.

**Estimated Time:** 1-2 weeks to provide time for researching, writing and planning group presentations. The amount of class time will vary with the group. (See Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions)

**Resources for Lesson**
- Articles provided with the unit, Appendix G: Articles on Topics in Education
- Computer lab, library, internet access for researching
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10  
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education  
Lesson 7: Researching, writing, and group presentations  
Time: 1-2 weeks to provide time for researching, writing and planning group presentations. The amount of class time will vary with the group. (See Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions)

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

- Synthesize and information acquired from sources.
- Consider all aspects of the sources in order to take an informed stance on a position.
- Use sources to create a position paper.

Essential Question addressed in this lesson:

Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.7 Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.9-10.8 Gather relevant information from authoritative print and digital sources, using advanced searches effectively; assess the usefulness of each source in answering the research question; integrate information into the text selectively to maintain the flow of ideas, avoiding plagiarism and following a standard format for citation.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:

- Decide to what extent the CEPA position paper and group presentation should be an independent performance task to demonstrate mastery as opposed to a coached learning opportunity for independent application of new skills.
- The groupings for research are at your discretion. While the recommendation is groups no larger than four, you may have students working individually, in pairs, or in group sizes of your choosing. While each student has to find one source individually, the other research can be conducted with his/her group.
- During the research process, it will be important for you to have a system to check in with student progress. You will want to check that students are choosing and evaluating appropriate sources, working collaboratively, and keeping appropriate pacing to meet a deadline.
- Students will need several days or a week to research their topic and develop their presentation. Alternatively, they can conduct some of the research and evaluation of sources as homework and then work on the group presentation during class time.
- Be sure to carefully consider your students and the resources that they have access to outside of school to develop a timeline for research that will work for your class.
- Consider how much school time your students will need with computer lab access and plan your schedule accordingly. Alternatively, if your school has the resources, you can coordinate with the library/tech specialist.
- To give yourself time to adequately review and comment on each student’s paper, you may want to plan a week or two on a different
topic between the students finishing their position papers and starting their group presentations.

**Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions:**
- Research is about looking finding resources. It does not involve making choices about resources.

**What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson**
- Students should have prior experience with MLA (Modern Language Association) and knowledge of school's research tools.
- Students should have prior experience with writing arguments or position papers.

**Lesson Sequence:**
The lesson sequence for this stage of the unit will vary from teacher to teacher. Students need to find at least one source on their own as well as reading, evaluating, and taking notes on the sources provided to them.
- For any in-class research or writing sessions that you do schedule, start each class with a brief mini-lesson.
- Reserve the bulk of the class time for research or writing and conference with students.
- Lesson closings could be a brief status update, share-out, or chances for students to receive advice (preferably from peers) about technical problem.

**Lesson Opening**
- Mini-lessons for research could include:
  - Search features
  - Note-taking strategies
  - Keeping track of sources (construction of the bibliography)
- Mini-lessons for writing could include:
  - Writing a paragraph to present the possible positions about the topic
  - Writing a paragraph to present the best position
  - Using evidence to support your stance, including how to attribute
  - Concluding your position paper
  - Introduction for a position paper
- Mini-lessons for group presentations could include:
  - Picking the best position about the topic to present as a group
  - Finding evidence for the position
  - Techniques for effective presentations
  - Balancing the use of statistics/data with anecdotes
  - Giving a presentation as a group

**During the Lesson**
- During the research and writing classes, as students work independently, check in or conference with different students to monitor progress, support, or provide coaching.

**Lesson Closing**
- During the research and writing classes, use the lesson closing as a status update, a chance to model the successful application of a technique highlighted in the day's mini-lesson, or for some peer to peer problem-solving.

**Formative assessment**
- Students’ notes, articles found in their individual searches, and rough drafts
Exploring Topics in Education
English Language Arts, Grade 10
Lesson 8

**Brief Overview:** Presenting the research (CEPA). Students will give their group presentations. Presentations will be critiqued by classmates using an evaluation protocol. For the presentation component of the CEPA you, again, may individualize this to meet your needs. The chosen length of your presentations may vary to meet the needs of diverse learners.

**Estimated Time:** You will need to decide the pacing for these presentations. This will include the number of presentations your students can productively listen to in one class, the length of the presentations, and the time period over which you want to complete the presentations, e.g. two presentations every Friday, for several weeks, all presentation in three days.

**Resources for Lesson**
- Group presentation materials, developed by each group
- Students will need to know how to fill out the presentation evaluation rubric, (see CEPA Resources: Presentation Evaluation, p. 42)
Content Area/Course: ELA Grade 10  
Unit: Exploring Topics in Education  
Lesson 6: Researching, writing, and group presentations  
Time: 1-2 weeks to provide time for researching, writing and planning group presentations. The amount of class time will vary with the group. (See Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions)

By the end of this lesson students will know and be able to:

- Listen to a presentation and recognize the presenters’ stance and main points.
- As a member of a group, give a presentation in a clear and organized manner so that the line of reasoning, evidence, and development of the position articulated in the presentation is clear to others.

Essential Question addressed in this lesson:

Q1. What does it mean to be educated?  
Q2. How do you identify bias in what you read, see and hear?  
Q3. How do people synthesize multiple sources to create an informed opinion?

Standard(s)/Unit Goal(s) to be addressed in this lesson:

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.3 Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, identifying any fallacious reasoning or exaggerated or distorted evidence.  
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.4 Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly, concisely, and logically such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task.

Instructional Tips/Strategies/Suggestions:

- While these are group presentations, individual student learning can be assessed through student analysis of the presentations.
- One option is to have the students prepare a detailed evaluation for one or two of the presentations instead of cursory evaluations for all of the presentations.
- Students can identify when information has been synthesized appropriately and when source material is valid.
- A model handout for this purpose appears in the resource section.
- You will need to decide the pacing for these presentations. This will include the number of presentations your students can productively listen to in one class, the length of the presentations, and the time period over which you want to complete the presentations, e.g. two presentations every Friday, for several weeks, all presentation in three days.

Anticipated Student Preconceptions/Misconceptions:

- Listening to presentations does not require anything from the audience.

What students need to know and are able to do coming into this lesson:

- Students will need to know how to fill out the presentation evaluation rubric, (See CEPA Resources: Presentation Evaluation, p. 42).
Lesson Sequence:

- Students may need a chance to have a dress rehearsal for their presentations. Remind them of any key criteria in a mini-lesson.
- Introduce the listening rubric and go over the expectations for the audience.

Formative assessment
Students prepare a detailed evaluation for one or two of the presentations instead of cursory evaluations for all of the presentations.
Curriculum Embedded Performance Assessments (CEPA) Resources: Teacher Instructions

**Goal:** Students will research an issue in education and write a position paper. In the paper, each student will present a few of the possible positions on the topic, take a stance/pick the best position, and support this stance with evidence from their research. Students will then work with their research group to create a presentation, from their position papers, about this topic.

**Role:** Students are part of a group of education experts.

**Audience:** The immediate audience is a politician running for office. By extension, the constituents that she/he would like to represent if elected are also an audience to consider.

**Situation:** A politician has hired the students to provide advice about an important topic in education through a position paper.

**Product Performance and Purpose:** Drawing from students' individual position papers, each group will create a presentation that outlines the key elements of the group’s topic, explores the range of positions on the topic, and takes a stance about the best position and provides logical claims with supporting evidence to explain the stance. The presentation must cite credible sources and use statistical if relevant.
Standards and Criteria for Success: Students will be judged on both their position papers and their role in the group presentation. Both should be well-researched, rich with evidence, clear, logical, and appealing for audiences with a range of backgrounds.
CEPA Resources: Student Instructions

You are an education expert (top in your field!) and a campaigning politician has come to you and your colleagues asking for a position paper about education. Should he or she be elected, promising positions await your team as educational advisors.

This politician needs to take a strong, public stance on the education issue your team has extensively researched. He or she needs to be able to communicate a position to voters that he/she can provide sound leadership in the area of education.

You are meeting with the politician on _____________ (due date!). Based on your team’s research, you must create a position paper that introduces the issue, presents a few of the possible positions, then selects the best position, and supports this stance with evidence from your research.

Drawing from your individual position papers, your group will create a presentation that outlines the key elements of your group’s topic, explores the range of positions on the topic, and takes a stance about the best position and provides logical claims with supporting evidence to explain your stance. The presentation must cite credible sources and use statistical if relevant.

You will be judge on both your position paper and your role in the group presentation. Both should be well-researched, rich with evidence, clear, logical, and appealing for audiences with a range of backgrounds.
### CEPA Resources: Rubric for Position Paper

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CC.9-10. SL4. Proposal includes supporting information and evidence. Presentation is clear, concise, and logical. Organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate for audience and task.</th>
<th><strong>Exceeds Standard</strong> 5</th>
<th><strong>Meets Standard</strong> 4</th>
<th><strong>Approaches Standard</strong> 3</th>
<th><strong>Attempt Made</strong> 2</th>
<th><strong>Insufficient Evidence</strong> 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Extensive information and evidence are used to support the proposal.</td>
<td>• Sufficient information and evidence are used to support the proposal.</td>
<td>• Some information and evidence are used to support the proposal.</td>
<td>• Inadequate use of information and evidence to support the proposal.</td>
<td>• Poor use of information and/or evidence.</td>
<td>• Poor use of information and/or evidence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Presentation is clear, concise, and logical.</td>
<td>• Presentation is clear and makes sense, although there are a few minor lapses in logic, or it may not be entirely concise.</td>
<td>• Logic can be discerned by the audience, but parts of the presentation are unclear, and/or the presentation is not concise.</td>
<td>• Presentation is lacks clarity, is illogical, and/or is not concise.</td>
<td>• Presentation does not make sense.</td>
<td>• Presentation does not make sense.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Organization and development provide subtle nuances that enhance the effectiveness of the proposal.</td>
<td>• Organization and development are effective.</td>
<td>• Organization and development have flaws, but the audience can understand the point</td>
<td>• Organization and development have been attempted, but one or both are not successful.</td>
<td>• Disorganized and underdeveloped</td>
<td>• Disorganized and underdeveloped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Substance and stylistic choices are particularly well-suited to the target audience.</td>
<td>• Substance and stylistic choices suit the target audience.</td>
<td>• Some of the stylistic choices do not suit the target audience</td>
<td>• Substance and stylistic choices are not suited to the target audience</td>
<td>• Does not suit the target audience at all</td>
<td>• Does not suit the target audience at all</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CC.9-10.W9. Evidence supports the analysis, reflection, and research</th>
<th><strong>Exceeds Standard</strong> 5</th>
<th><strong>Meets Standard</strong> 4</th>
<th><strong>Approaches Standard</strong> 3</th>
<th><strong>Attempt Made</strong> 2</th>
<th><strong>Insufficient Evidence</strong> 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Evidence is derived from valid source material, is included accurately, and supports the analysis and proposal effectively</td>
<td>• Evidence is derived from valid source material, is included accurately, and supports the analysis and proposal</td>
<td>• Evidence is derived from valid source material, is included accurately, and supports some of the points.</td>
<td>• Evidence is derived from valid source material, is included accurately, and is tangentially related to the proposal, but</td>
<td>• Evidence is derived from invalid source material OR it is inaccurate OR it is not related at all to the issue.</td>
<td>• Evidence is derived from invalid source material OR it is inaccurate OR it is not related at all to the issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Evidence is derived from valid source material, is included accurately, and supports the analysis and proposal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC.9-10.W7. Proposal is based on a research question created by the student/team. Presentation synthesizes multiple sources and demonstrates understanding of the issue.</td>
<td>• Proposal is based on a careful and effective synthesis of the research questions created by each student on the team. • Presentation includes the careful and effective synthesis of multiple resources • Presentation demonstrates a thorough understanding of the issue being presented.</td>
<td>• Proposal is based on synthesis of research questions created by each student on the team. • Presentation includes synthesis of multiple resources • Presentation demonstrates students understand the issue.</td>
<td>• Proposal is based on some, but not all, of the research questions created by the team. • Presentation incorporates information from different resources awkwardly • Presentation demonstrates students understand parts of the issue</td>
<td>• An attempt has been made to synthesize the research questions; however, the presentation is mostly one-sided. • Presentation attempts to incorporate information from multiple sources, but is not successful • Presentation demonstrates students have a very limited understanding of the issue</td>
<td>• No evidence of synthesis of research questions is evident or there is no evidence of a research question • Very few sources have been used or several sources about the same part of the issue have been used. • Presentation demonstrates students’ understanding does not go beyond classroom discussions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal includes a written piece/handout, visual element, and the speaking</td>
<td>• All required elements are present, done professionally, and are free of errors</td>
<td>• All required elements are present and done well, but they contain a few errors</td>
<td>• All required elements are present, but there are several errors</td>
<td>• All of the required elements are present, but several are done poorly</td>
<td>Requirements have not been met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLA documentation</td>
<td>• All information has been cited correctly both in the presentation and ancillary materials</td>
<td>• All information has been cited correctly in the presentation</td>
<td>• A few minor errors are present, but not to the extent of plagiarism</td>
<td>• Several errors are present, but not to the extent of plagiarism</td>
<td>Many errors or potentially plagiarized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammar/spelling/mechanics</td>
<td>• All pieces are free of errors in grammar, spelling, and mechanics</td>
<td>• A couple of errors appear but do not interfere with the audience’s understanding of the proposal</td>
<td>• There are many errors throughout the presentation; however, the errors do not interfere with the audience’s understanding</td>
<td>• Errors interfere with the audience’s understanding of part of the proposal, but the audience can figure it out.</td>
<td>• Errors render the proposal incomprehensible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public speaking strategies (posture, projection, enunciation, volume, appearance)</td>
<td>• All team members demonstrate excellent use of strategies</td>
<td>• All team members use most of the strategies well</td>
<td>• Most of the team members use the strategies well, but there are some problems</td>
<td>• Use of strategies is sporadic among the team members</td>
<td>• Team does not use any of the strategies well</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CEPA Resources: Presentation Evaluation

For each of the following categories, rate the presenters and then provide evidence to support your rating.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Fair</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate for audience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid/extensive evidence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Synthesis/demonstrates understanding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discuss something the presenters did very well.
Recommend one thing the presenters could do better next time.
Unit Resources

Core Texts:
- *What Is Intelligence, Anyway?* by Isaac Asimov
  http://www.radford.edu/~jmontuor/Asimov%20on%20intelligence.htm
- *The Psychopathic School* by John Taylor Gatto:
  http://theroadtoemmaus.org/RdLb/21PbAr/Ed/GattoPsyPathSchl.htm
- Copies of *Earnings and unemployment rates by educational attainment* chart:
  http://www.bls.gov/emp/ep_chart_001.htm/
- Copies of *Why College Isn’t For Everyone* by Richard Vedder: http://www.businessweek.com/articles/2012-04-09/why-college-isnt-for-everyone
- Copies of the mission statement of the Center for College Affordability and Productivity:
  http://centerforcollegeaffordability.org/about/mission-statement

Materials:
- Copies of Appendices (see lessons for numbers needed)
- Large sheets of chart paper (or sufficient board space)
- Sticky notes
- A projector, interactive white board, overhead projector, or document camera
Appendices

A. Objectivity and Bias
B. Subjective and Objective Informational Texts
C. Issues in Education Anticipation Guide
D. The Last Word protocol
E. Generating a Research Question
F. Evaluating a Website
G. Articles on Topics in Education
Appendix A: Objectivity and Bias

Part of the goal of this unit is help students recognize bias in source materials to help make a judgment about texts that are primarily informational and texts that present an argument. To review the difference between objectivity and subjectivity in written work, several suggestions to distinguish them are included below. Several resources are included that present a more objective overview of the history of American education that may be useful, before delving into more complex, politically-charged issues. This material could be used, as needed, after the opening lesson. The SOAPSTone chart that appears under section II can also support students in analyzing source material.

I. Review of objectivity and subjectivity

The following chart includes quotes about compulsory schooling. Students can work individually or in groups to consider the language of each quote. They should identify facts, opinions and specific words that indicate a value judgment in each piece of text. This can be followed by a class discussion about which quote is objective and the evidence that led students to determine that.
Compulsory Schooling: Objective or Subjective statements?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Material</th>
<th>Fact</th>
<th>Opinion</th>
<th>Words or phrases suggesting a value judgment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“A healthy democracy depends on people who are informed about issues. Citizens vote, and take part in other civic duties. Educated people are likely to make better choices” (Why Do Kids Have to Go to School? Source: Washington Post)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Common school advocates worked to establish a free elementary education accessible to everyone and financed by public funds. As such they advocated public schools should be accountable to local school boards and state governments. They also established compulsory attendance laws for elementary aged children.” (Source: Chesapeake.edu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Whereas education is vital to children, it does not necessarily have to be attained in a traditional school setting. Thousands of children have flourished in home school environments...Similarly, children for centuries have received excellent education from tutors” (Source: Debate.org)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Further review of objectivity and subjectivity
Students who might need a more comprehensive review of objective vs. subjective sources can complete a SOAPSTone analysis of any source contained within the unit (subjective) and use a resource from Section III below (objective). While often used to plan writing, the same questions can be used to examine a written text. SOAPSTone can be used to launch a comparative discussion of sources to clarify differences between informational text and argumentation. For more information about SOAPStone please visit College Board’s AP Central website: [http://apcentral.collegeboard.com/apc/public/preap/teachers_corner/45200.html](http://apcentral.collegeboard.com/apc/public/preap/teachers_corner/45200.html)
III. Additional resources about the history of American Education

The History of Education in America:  http://www.chesapeake.edu/Library/EDU_101/eduhist.asp

School: The Story of American Public Education:  http://www.pbs.org/kcet/publicschool/. (Note: This site is a companion piece to a documentary that was released by PBS)

American Education Week Timeline: http://www.nea.org/grants/47607.htm
Appendix B: Subjective and Objective Informational Text

Before reading, write quick definitions to the following words:

- Subjective:

- Objective:

- Bias:

Questions to consider when reading:

- What are the claims that the author is making?
- What is the evidence in the text for the author's claims?
- Do you think author is using sound or faulty evidence? (What is your evidence?)
- Do you think the author is presenting a range of positions or does he/she have a particular point of view or bias?
- What is the author's point of view? (What is your evidence?)
- Do you agree with the author's point of view? Do you need to seek further evidence from other sources?
- Do you think the text you have just read is subjective or objective? (What is your evidence?)
Appendix C: Issues in Education Anticipation Guide

Name____________________________________________________________     Date______________________________

Directions: Agree (A) or disagree (D) with each of the following statements. After each statement, write 1-2 sentences explaining your decision.

1. Homework is necessary and helpful for learning. ___________ 6. Cell phones and other technology are distracting in the classroom.

2. Starting the school day later in the morning would help students to accomplish more. ___________ 7. More online learning options should be available for high school students.

3. Standardized testing is good because it guarantees that all students meet required learning expectations. ___________ 8. Even after high school education, most students are not prepared for college.

4. All students should be grouped together in the same classes. ___________ 9. If college is too expensive, it is not worth going.

5. Students should be allowed to choose where they go to school. ___________ 10. Non-English speakers should be educated in their native language.
Appendix D: The Last Word Protocol

Before you begin this discussion protocol, you should actively read through the piece you’ve been given, select 3-4 sentences or sections of text that strike you, and make notes on your text about why. You will need a timekeeper in your group.

1. The first person in your group reads a quote he/she selected, but say nothing else.

2. The person to his or her left has 30 seconds to respond to the quote with his or her personal reaction to it and/or thoughts about why it was chosen.

3. Continuing clockwise, every other person in the group also has 30 seconds to respond to the quote, building off of what their classmates have said.

4. Finally, the person who selected the quote has “the last word,” and will have 1 minute to explain why he/she chose it and respond to comments that classmates made.

5. The process repeats itself until each person in the group has shared his/her quote and been given “the last word.”
Appendix E: Generating a Research Question

Once you have a topic that you are interested in, ask yourself these questions:

- What do I want to know about this topic?
- Is there a lot of information about this topic?
- Are there controversies surrounding this topic? If so, what are they?
- Do I have an opinion on this topic? Do others?

Once you have answered these questions, you must create a research question.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Research Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Example: College Costs</td>
<td>Example: Should every student go to college?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A strong research question:

- Is open-ended
- Is interesting
- Is specific
- Could answered with various opinions
- Can be supported by a body of information
- Makes you think deeply about the topic
- Lends itself to a strong thesis statement
Appendix F: Evaluating a Website

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Who is the author?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What is the author's background?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is the author associated with a university, corporation, etc.?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the mission/purpose of this organization?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is it easy to find information about the author and/or organization?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Can you contact him or her?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What information is given?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is it fact or opinion?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is there a bias in the information presented on the web-site?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Is the information consistent with information from other sources?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>When was the site last updated?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Is the date important? Is the date recent?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Where did the author get his or her information?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Do the links work?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How did I get to this site?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What information does the domain give me (.com, etc.)?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Why was the site created?

- Is the purpose of the site clear?

- Is this information easy to find?

- Is this site better than other sites I have used? Why or why not?

### My final opinion of this website:
Appendix G: Articles on Topics in Education

The purpose of texts listed below is to help students develop research questions and evaluate sources. Students should determine the degree of quality for themselves. If they are handed all high quality, unbiased sources, they will never learn this skill.

**Homework**
Alfie Kohn Rethinking Homework - [http://www.alfiekohn.org/parenting/gj.htm](http://www.alfiekohn.org/parenting/gj.htm)

**Learning Time**
Education Next: Time for School? [www.educationnext.org](http://www.educationnext.org)

**Standardized Testing**
Alfie Kohn anti-standardized testing [www.alfiekohn.org/teaching/edweek/staiv.htm](http://www.alfiekohn.org/teaching/edweek/staiv.htm)

**School Choice**

**Costs/College**

**Technology in the Classroom**

**Online Learning**
Alliance for Excellent Education - http://www.all4ed.org/publication_material/RuralRoad

**Bilingual Education**
Huffington Post: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/08/01/ucla-professors-create-national-dream-university_n_1729623.html